



**CHARACTERISTICS OF CHRONIC ANKLE INSTABILITY AND THE ROLE OF
JOINT MOBILISATION**

Rajapaksha Mudiyansele Ishanka Madhurangani Weerasekara

MPhil, BSc (Physiotherapy)

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Physiotherapy)

The University of Newcastle

August 2019

This research was supported by an Australian Government Research Training
Program (RTP) Scholarship

This is to certify that the thesis entitled '**Characteristics of Chronic Ankle Instability and the Role of Joint Mobilisation**' submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Physiotherapy) is in a form ready for examination.

Signed _____

Date 16 August 2019

Ishanka Weerasekara

School of Health Sciences

Faculty of Health and Medicine

The University of Newcastle

DECLARATION

I hereby certify that the work embodied in the thesis is my own work, conducted under normal supervision. The thesis contains no material which has been accepted, or is being examined, for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University's Digital Repository, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968 and any approved embargo.

I hereby certify that this thesis is in the form of a series of papers. I have included as part of the thesis a written declaration from each co-author, endorsed in writing by the Faculty Assistant Dean (Research Training), attesting to my contribution to any jointly authored papers.

Ishanka Weerasekara

Signature

16 August 2019

Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis marks the end of my candidature as a PhD student and I could not have accomplished it alone. There are numerous people to whom I owe my gratitude.

First and foremost, I express my sincere thanks to Professor Darren Rivett, Dr Peter Osmotherly and Associate Professor Suzanne Snodgrass for their patience, guidance and support during my PhD candidature. I am also extremely grateful to John Tessier and Dr Sarah Walmsley for their enormous assistance with some of the studies contained in this thesis.

My heartfelt thanks goes to Dr Jodie Marquez, Lucia Chambers, Associate Professor Coralie English and all the Discipline of Physiotherapy staff members at The University of Newcastle. I found a very lovely friend in each of you, and appreciate the research opportunities you provided and the support you gave me during my stay in Newcastle.

Thank you very much to my kind study participants who gave their time willingly to participate in my research. Without your generosity this thesis would not have been possible.

I also wish to acknowledge my dear friends, ‘the PhD warriors’ of the School of Health Sciences. We shared many things from birthday cake to debriefs about our progress, and helped each other overcome challenges in our studies. You made my time in Australia very memorable. Katherine, special thanks to you for being a beautiful friend to me and my family. Also to all of my lovely Sri Lankan friends and families in Newcastle. Thank you so much for your company, love and time spent with me and my family. I did not miss home much when I was with you all.

My sincere respect goes to Professor Chula Goonasekera, Dr Hilary Suraweera, Professor Shyama Banneheka and the physiotherapy academic staff members of the University of Peradeniya, Sri Lanka. I am proud to say that I am from the first cohort of the BSc (Physiotherapy) programme of Sri Lanka that you established.

I would also like to share the pride of this achievement with my Amma, Thaththa, Nangi, Malli, Achchila, and also to my Seeya looking down from heaven. This journey started from the day you taught me 'A, E, I, O, U', Thaththa. Thank you so much.

I would like to share the tears of joy with nobody else, but with you my better half Chamara. Thank you for your big heart, your shoulder to cry on, and listening to me throughout this whole process. I love you to the moon and back. And to you Shenara and Evan - I will share 100% of my time with you two after this I promise.

Lastly, I want to share this message I found somewhere on Twitter. It captures most of my feelings and I cannot write it any better: "I am a person of colour. I am an immigrant. I came from a third world country. English is my second language. I am minority. Australia has given me the opportunity to establish a wonderful life for my family. I am grateful."

PUBLICATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS

Papers published and submitted for publication in peer-reviewed journals as part of this thesis:

1. Weerasekara, I., Osmotherly, P., Snodgrass, S., Marquez, J., de Zoete, R., & Rivett, D. A. (2018). Clinical benefits of joint mobilisation on ankle sprains: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Archives of Physical Medicine & Rehabilitation*, 99(7), 1395-1412.e1395. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apmr.2017.07.019>
2. Weerasekara, I., Osmotherly, P. G., Snodgrass, S. J., Tessier, J., & Rivett, D. A. (2019). Effects of mobilisation with movement (MWM) on anatomical and clinical characteristics of chronic ankle instability: a randomised controlled trial protocol. *BMC Musculoskeletal Disorders*, 20(1), 75. doi:10.1186/s12891-019-2447-x
3. Weerasekara, I., Osmotherly, P., Snodgrass, S., Tesseir, J., & Rivett, D. A. (2019). Is the fibula positioned anteriorly in weight-bearing in individuals with chronic ankle instability? (under review).
4. Weerasekara, I., Snodgrass, S., Osmotherly, P., Tessier, J., & Rivett, D. A. (2019). Clinical characteristics of chronic ankle instability: a case-control study (under review).

Published abstracts from peer-reviewed conferences:

1. Weerasekara, I., Osmotherly, P., Snodgrass, S., de Zoete, R., & Rivett, D. (2016, October 12-15). Clinical benefits of passive joint mobilisation on ankle sprains. In *Journal of Science &*

Medicine in Sport. Paper presented at the Sports Medicine Australia Conference, Sydney, Australia. 20, e49. doi:10.1016/j.jsams.2017.01.133

2. Weerasekara, I., Osmotherly, P., Snodgrass, S., Marquez, J., de Zoete, R., & Rivett, D. (2017, October 19-21). A systematic review and meta-analysis of the clinical benefits of passive joint mobilisation on ankle sprains. Paper presented at the *Australian Physiotherapy Association Conference*, Sydney, Australia.
3. Weerasekara, I., Osmotherly, P., Snodgrass, S., Tessier, J., & Rivett, D. (2019, May 10-13). Fibular position in chronic ankle instability (CAI) and the reliability of weight-bearing radiographic measurements of fibular position. Paper presented at the *World Confederation for Physical Therapy Congress*, Geneva, Switzerland.
4. Weerasekara, I., Osmotherly, P., Snodgrass, S., Tessier, J., & Rivett, D. (2019, October 3-4). Fibular position in chronic ankle instability radiographically measured in weight-bearing (accepted). Paper will be presented at the *8th International Ankle Symposium*, Amsterdam, Netherlands.

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	Reported abnormalities of fibula position in lateral ankle ligament injuries	48
Table 3.1	Search strategy	65
Table 3.2	Description of the eligible studies.....	71
Table 3.3	Number of outcome evaluations investigating at each time point of interest, listed by the reported positive effects	101
Table 3.4	Assessment of the quality of evidence	106
Table 4.1	Characteristics of the participants	125
Table 4.2	Comparison of fibular position between individuals with unstable ankles and healthy ankles	126
Table 4.3	Characteristics of receiver operating characteristic (ROC) curve for fibular position	127
Table 4.4	Intra-class correlation coefficient (ICC _{2,1}) and standard error of measurement (SEM) with 95% confidence intervals (CI) for inter-rater and intra-rater reliability of measurements of fibular position	128
Table 5.1	Characteristics of the participants in each group	145
Table 5.2	Comparison of characteristics between individuals with CAI and healthy individuals, and between the affected ankle and other ankle of CAI participants ...	148
Table 5.3	Bivariate correlations identified as being statistically significant (p<.05) for the CAI affected ankle	153
Table 5.4	Results of final multivariate regression model (backwards Wald method, R ² =0.413) indicating variables predicting group membership of CAI (n=66)	156

Table 6.1	Inclusion and exclusion criteria	170
Table 7.1	Participants characteristics	218
Table 7.2	Effect of MWM with taping on outcomes in individuals with CAI	207
Table 7.3	Effect of MWM with taping on the changes in outcomes at each time point in individuals with CAI	213
Table 7.4	Effects of MWM with taping on individuals with a displaced fibula (i.e. normalised fibular position ≥ 27), compared to individuals with a normally positioned fibular on the changes of primary outcomes at each time point	220
Table 7.5	Effects of MWM with taping on individuals with a mechanically unstable ankle compared to individuals with a mechanically stable ankle on the changes of primary outcomes at each time point	222

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1	A schematic representation of the lateral ligaments of the ankle complex	27
Figure 3.1	Flow chart of study selection	90
Figure 3.2	Funnel plots	91
Figure 3.3	Percentage and number of outcome evaluations with and without positive findings following each technique combination of mobilisation for any clinically relevant outcome at any time point	93
Figure 3.4	PEDro scores for assessment of quality of individual criteria	95
Figure 3.5	Quality assessment tool for observational cohort and cross-sectional studies	96
Figure 3.6	PEDro scores for assessment of quality of individual intervention studies	98
Figure 3.7	Quality assessment tool for observational cohort and cross-sectional studies scores for assessment of quality of individual cohort studies	99
Figure 3.8	MD (95% CI) of the immediate effect of joint mobilisation on dynamic balance by pooling data from 5 studies (n=180)	103
Figure 3.9	SMD (95% CI) of the immediate effect of joint mobilisation on static balance by pooling data from 3 studies (n=100)	103
Figure 3.10	SMD (95% CI) of the immediate effect of joint mobilisation on weight-bearing DFROM by pooling data from 7 studies (n=249)	104
Figure 3.11	SMD (95% CI) of the immediate effect of joint mobilisation on pain intensity by pooling data from 2 studies (n=47)	104
Figure 3.12	SMD (95% CI) of the short-term effect of joint mobilisation on weight-bearing DFROM by pooling data from 2 studies (n=94)	105

Figure 4.1	Measurement of normalised fibular position	121
Figure 4.2	Overview of the recruitment process	123
Figure 4.3	Receiver operating characteristic (ROC) curve used to calculate the area under the curve and cut-off score for normalised fibular position	127
Figure 5.1	Inclusion and exclusion criteria for individuals with CAI	138
Figure 5.2	Flow chart of participants in the selection process	144
Figure 6.1	Flow of the study	174
Figure 6.2	Fibular position measurement; the distance between the anterior edge of the distal fibula and the anterior edge of the distal tibia	176
Figure 6.3	Anterior translation of the talus during the anterior drawer stress test is measured as the distance on X-ray from the posterior lip of the tibial joint surface to the nearest point of the talar dome	184
Figure 7.1	Design and flow of participants through the trial	195

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ADL	activities of daily living
AMI	axial malleolar index
ANZCTR	Australian New Zealand Clinical Trial Registry
AP	antero-posterior
APTA	American Physical Therapy Association
ATFL	anterior talofibular ligament
AUC	area under the curve
BMI	body mass index
CAI	chronic ankle instability
CAIT	Cumberland ankle instability tool
CFL	calcaneofibular ligament
CI	confidence interval
CoP	centre of pressure
CT	computed tomography
df	degrees of freedom
DFROM	dorsiflexion range of motion
FAAM	foot and ankle ability measure
FAOS	foot and ankle outcome score

GRADE	Grading of recommendations, assessment, development and evaluation
HVLA	high velocity low amplitude
IAC	International Ankle Consortium
ICC	intra-class correlation coefficient
ICF	International classification of functioning, disability and health
IMI	intermalleolar index
ITT	intention to treat
IV	inverse variance
LR	likelihood ratio
MCID	minimal clinically important difference
MD	mean difference
MDC	minimal detectable change
ML	medio-lateral
MRI	magnetic resonance imaging
MWM	mobilisation with movement
N/A	not applicable
OR	odds ratio
PL	postero-lateral
PM	postero-medial
POLICE	protection, optimal loading, ice, compression and elevation

PPT	pressure pain threshold
PTFL	posterior talofibular ligament
QOL	quality of life
RCT	randomised controlled trial
RICE	rest, ice, compression and elevation
ROC	receiver operating characteristic
ROM	range of motion
SD	standard deviation
SE	standard error
SEBT	star excursion balance test
SEM	standard error of measurement
SMD	standard mean difference
TCJ	talocrural joint
TFJ	tibiofibular joint
TTS	time to stabilisation
VAS	visual analogue scale
WHO	World Health Organisation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
PUBLICATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS	vi
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	1
Abstract.....	8
Chapter 1 Introduction	11
1.1 Background and context.....	11
1.1.1 Chronic ankle instability (CAI).....	11
1.1.2 Prevalence, effects and burden of CAI	12
1.1.3 Rehabilitation of CAI.....	14
1.1.4 Principles of MWM	15
1.2 Research aims	17
1.3 Significance.....	17
1.4 Overview of the thesis	19
1.5 Scope/delimitations.....	20
Chapter 2 Literature review	22

2.1 Chronic ankle instability (CAI).....	22
2.1.1 General description of CAI.....	22
2.1.2 Defining CAI	23
2.1.3 Mechanism of CAI.....	24
2.2 Anatomy and pathophysiology of CAI.....	25
2.2.1 Talocrural joint.....	25
2.2.2 Subtalar joint.....	27
2.2.3 Distal tibiofibular syndesmosis.....	28
2.3 Clinical evaluation and diagnosis of CAI	30
2.3.1 Patient reported findings	31
2.3.2 Physical examination and tests	35
2.3.3 Radiological examination	46
2.3.4 Other tools to assess CAI.....	54
2.4 Management of CAI	54
2.4.1 Conservative interventions.....	55
2.4.2. Surgical interventions	58
2.5 Summary	59
Chapter 3 Clinical benefits of joint mobilisation on ankle sprains: a systematic review and meta-analysis.....	61
Overview.....	61
3.1 Introduction.....	63
3.2 Method.....	65
3.2.1 Registration.....	65

3.2.2 Search strategy	65
3.2.3 Identification and selection of studies.....	67
3.2.4 Assessment of methodological quality	70
3.2.5 Assessment of the quality of evidence.....	70
3.2.6 Data extraction and statistical analysis	70
3.3 Results.....	89
3.3.1 Selection and characteristics of included studies	89
3.3.2 Common mobilisation techniques used in rehabilitation of ankle sprains.....	93
3.3.3 Quality of studies	95
3.3.4 Effects of mobilisation on sub-acute/chronic ankle sprains.....	101
3.3.5 Immediate effects of mobilisation on ankle sprains.....	103
3.3.6 Short-term effects of mobilisation on ankle sprains	106
3.3.7 Long-term effects of mobilisation on ankle sprains.....	107
3.3.8 Quality of evidence	107
3.4 Discussion.....	109
3.4.1 Study limitations	113
3.5 Conclusion	114
Chapter 4 Is the fibula positioned anteriorly in weight-bearing in individuals with chronic ankle instability?.....	115
Overview.....	115
4.1 Introduction.....	117
4.2 Materials and methods	119
4.2.1 Analysis.....	122

4.3 Results.....	124
4.3.1 Participant characteristics	125
4.3.2 Comparison of fibular position	125
4.3.3 ROC analysis	125
4.3.4 Reliability of the weight-bearing X-Ray measures of fibular position	129
4.5 Discussion.....	130
Chapter 5 Clinical characteristics of chronic ankle instability: a case-control study.....	136
Overview.....	136
5.1 Introduction.....	137
5.2 Methods.....	139
5.2.1 Participants.....	139
5.2.3 Procedures.....	141
5.2.3 Analysis.....	144
5.3 Results.....	146
5.3.1 Participant characteristics	146
5.3.2 Comparison of the characteristics	148
5.3.3 Regression analysis.....	155
5.4 Discussion.....	159
5.5 Conclusion	164
Chapter 6 Effects of mobilisation with movement (MWM) on anatomical and clinical characteristics of chronic ankle instability: a randomised controlled trial protocol.....	166
Overview.....	166

6.1 Introduction.....	168
6.2 Methods.....	171
6.2.1 Design	171
6.2.2 Participants.....	171
6.2.3 Procedure	172
6.2.4 Outcome measures	178
6.2.5 Application of the intervention	188
6.2.6 Sample size and data analysis	190
6.3 Discussion.....	191
Chapter 7 Mobilisation with movement with taping is not effective in changing fibular position or improving clinical outcomes in chronic ankle instability: a randomised controlled trial	193
Overview.....	193
7.1 Introduction.....	195
7.2 Materials and Methods.....	197
7.2.1 Design	197
7.2.2 Participants, therapists, centres	198
7.2.3 Intervention	199
7.2.4 Outcome measures	201
7.2.5 Data analysis	204
7.3 Results.....	205
7.3.1 Flow of participants, therapists, centres through the study	205
7.3.2 Compliance with trial method.....	207
7.3.3 Effect of ‘Mulligan’s MWM with fibular repositioning taping’ intervention.....	207

7.3.4 Effect on fibular position in individuals with CAI.....	208
7.3.5 Effect on common clinical measures in individuals with CAI.....	208
7.3.6 Effect on subgroups	209
7.4 Discussion.....	227
Chapter 8 Discussion and conclusions.....	231
8.1 Summary of study findings.....	232
8.2 Significance of the findings of the thesis	235
8.3 Strengths and limitations of the studies	237
8.3.1 Systematic review	237
8.3.2 Case-control study.....	238
8.3.3 Randomised controlled trial	239
8.4 Clinical implications of findings.....	241
8.5 Future research.....	242
8.6 Conclusions.....	243
References.....	245
Appendices.....	289
Appendix 1 Statements of collaboration from co-authors	289
Statement from Darren A. Rivett relating to papers published with Ishanka Weerasekara	290
Statement from Peter G. Osmotherly relating to papers published with Ishanka Weerasekara.....	292
Statement from Suzanne J. Snodgrass relating to papers published with Ishanka Weerasekara ..	294
Statement from John Tessier relating to papers published with Ishanka Weerasekara.....	296
Statement from Jodie Marquez relating to a paper published with Ishanka Weerasekara.....	298

Statement from Rutger de Zoete relating to a paper published with Ishanka Weerasekara.....	300
Appendix 2 Human research ethics committee approval: case-control study	303
Appendix 3 Human research ethics committee approval: randomised controlled trial	307
Appendix 4 Safety review notification	311
Appendix 5 Dosimetry report: case-control study	314
Appendix 6 Dosimetry report: randomised controlled trial	316
Appendix 7 PROSPERO systematic review registration notification	318
Appendix 8 ANZCTR clinical trial registration notification	320
Appendix 9 Information statement: case-control study	322
Appendix 10 Consent form: case-control study.....	327
Appendix 11 Information statement: randomised controlled trial	329
Appendix 12 Consent form: randomised controlled trial.....	335
Appendix 13 Participant recruitment flyers: case-control study.....	337
Appendix 14 Participant recruitment flyers: randomised controlled trial.....	340
Appendix 15 Data collection forms (both case-control and RCT studies) including questionnaires.....	343
Appendix 16 Journal publications.....	359

Abstract

Chronic ankle instability (CAI) is the occurrence of giving way and/or recurrent sprain and/or feelings of instability of a previously injured ankle. Compared to a simple ankle sprain, the additional morbidity and additional costs incurred due to diagnostic imaging related to CAI create significant economic and other societal consequences. Direct costs can include consultations with physicians, physiotherapists and other health professionals, diagnostic imaging and various hospital expenses, while indirect costs may arise from productivity losses, absenteeism (from school, work and sports) and diminished levels of physical activity resulting in economic burden on the healthcare system and for the individual patient. Rehabilitation of CAI commonly involves manual therapy procedures applied to joints in the ankle region, such as non-thrust passive joint mobilisation, high-velocity thrust manipulation and mobilisation with movement (MWM) as described by Brian Mulligan. These techniques largely involve a continuum of skilled passive movements of joints that are applied at different speeds and amplitudes. The overall aims of this thesis were to explore the clinical characteristics of CAI and to determine the effects of joint mobilisation in CAI. This thesis comprises four studies designed to meet these aims, presented as five manuscripts which have either been published in peer-reviewed journals or are in the process of review or submission.

Study 1 is a systematic review and meta-analysis undertaken to evaluate the current evidence for joint mobilisation in the clinical rehabilitation of ankle sprains, using the previously published body of literature. Based upon this investigation, joint mobilisation appears to be beneficial for improving dynamic balance immediately after application and dorsiflexion range of movement in the short-term

in chronic ankle sprains. The results of this study also suggested that the combination of MWM and associated fibular repositioning taping is more likely to exhibit a clinical benefit than other assessed mobilisation techniques, and potentially supporting the hypothesis of Brian Mulligan that the distal fibula is displaced anteriorly in CAI.

Study 2 explored the position of the distal fibula in relation to the position of the distal tibia in CAI using weight-bearing radiographs. The findings of this study indicated that there is a more anteriorly positioned fibula in individuals with CAI compared to individuals with healthy ankles when assessed in a weight-bearing position, consistent with Mulligan's hypothesis. Notably, this study was the first to use weight-bearing radiographs to measure the fibula position in CAI.

Study 3 investigated other clinical characteristics of CAI including ankle dorsiflexion range of motion, balance, self-reported function, pain and pressure pain threshold which have not been consistently reported, or for which little research has been published in the previous literature. It was found that individuals with CAI exhibit a multi-factorial presentation including impaired ankle dorsiflexion range, reduced static and dynamic balance, lower self-reported function and greater pain intensity, compared to individuals with healthy ankles. Despite the persistence of pain often reported in CAI, no evidence was found to suggest maladaptive central nervous system sensitisation (nociplastic pain).

Study 4 involved a randomised controlled trial (RCT) to investigate the effects of MWM of the distal tibio-fibular joint with fibular repositioning taping on fibular position and other clinical characteristics of CAI. The protocol for this study was published, and in contrast to almost all previously published studies of this manual therapy technique, highlighted the long-term nature of the trial with a one year follow-up. The immediate and short-term findings revealed no significant differences in any of the outcomes measured except for improvements in two self-reported function subscales (pain and sports on the foot and ankle outcome score (FAOS) questionnaire) in the placebo (detuned laser) intervention group. The long-term results were still being collected at the time of the submission of this thesis so are not reported or considered in the discussion.

The body of work contained in this thesis extends our current understanding of CAI and its clinical management. The results have implications for the identification of the features of CAI and for improving its treatment using joint mobilisation. Reproduction of the contained research using more homogeneous samples of CAI may permit a greater understanding of this persistent condition and how it responds to manual therapy. In addition, the use of weight-bearing radiographs in future studies to assess fibula position may be a more functional method. Other future directions for research and implications for clinical practice are discussed in detail in relation to the results of each of the studies in this thesis.